Has a DNA test solved the Rudolf Hess *doppelgänger* mystery?

Andrew Rosthorn

It is forty years since the publication of *The Murder of Rudolf Hess* by the former British Army surgeon Hugh Thomas. The introduction to that book was written by Dame Rebecca West, a daring feminist and ally of Orwell in the 1930s anti-communist awkward squad who had a son and a ten-year affair with H.G. Wells. In her introduction, West suggested it was

'. . . the duty of those who have consciences to take over the task where Mr Thomas leaves it and ascertain by the simple tests this book suggests whether the demented survivor in Spandau is or is not Hess.'

On 11 January 2019, in a 22-page scientific report for the May 2019 edition of the journal *Forensic Science International: Genetics*, thirteen authors delivered a scientific answer to the question posed by Dame Rebecca.

Rebecca West reported the 1946 Nuremberg trials for *The Daily Telegraph* and *The New Yorker*, describing the International Military Tribunal trial of the surviving Nazi big shots as 'a historic peep-show'. Her fastidious editor at *The New Yorker*, William Shawn, said:

'No one in this century wrote more dazzling prose, or had more wit, or looked at the intricacies of character and the ways of the world more intelligently.'

For months in a 'citadel of boredom' she examined the face of the strange amnesiac produced by the British government as Adolf Hitler's deputy and delivered for post-war trial in Germany after crash-landing a German fighterbomber in Scotland on 10 May 1941.

She watched the four allied judges convict Hitler's *Stellvertreter* of conspiracy to commit war crimes and crimes against peace and saw them send him to West Berlin, to serve a life sentence as Prisoner No. 7 in Spandau Prison.

In 1979 Major Hugh Thomas (a British Army bullet wound surgeon fresh from the Musgrave Park army hospital in Northern Ireland) reported that he could not find the scars of Rudolf Hess's well-known First World War bullet wound on the chest of Prisoner No. 7,¹

¹ See Robin Ramsay, '*Hess, "Hess" and the "peace Party"*, a review of Hugh Thomas, *A Tale of Two Murders*, in *Lobster* 17, November 1988.

Dame Rebecca declared adamantly:

'There is no guarantee a historian can accept that the fugitive was Hess; and there is therefore no guarantee a historian can accept that the British Government was right in handing over the fugitive as Hess after the war to the International Court at Nuremberg.'

And:

'It is the duty of those who have consciences to take over the task where Mr Thomas leaves it and ascertain by the simple tests this book suggests whether the demented survivor in Spandau is or is not Hess. It should be enquired also whether governments themselves have, with intent or through negligence, become parties to a foolish and wicked conspiracy.'²

Five years after the book's publication, came the accidental discovery by the geneticist Dr Alec Jeffreys at the University of Leicester in 1984 that repetitive patterns of DNA are not only present in all human beings but vary in length for each individual. By 1986 British DNA profiling had exonerated an innocent 17-year old man who had confessed to a murder and in January 1988 the British jailed the real murderer, making Colin Pitchfork the world's first killer trapped by DNA profiling.

The implementation of DNA profiling in Britain coincided with the sudden death of Prisoner No. 7 in 1987, the last of the allied war crimes prisoners held in Spandau.

The prison lay in the British sector of Berlin and the medical care of the Nuremberg tribunal prisoners had always been the responsibility of doctors at the British military hospital. It was this responsibility that led Major Hugh Thomas, army surgeon for the British sector, to a *eureka* moment in 1973:

'With the light in the X-ray room on again, the patient sat up on the edge of the bed, still happy and relaxed. Then someone called out that the films were all right, and that No. 7 could get dressed. At once he slipped off his shift – still sitting on the edge of the table – and began to pull on the warmer dressing gown. As he did so, I again had a clear view of his chest. I stepped forward and pointed at it, saying in a friendly, straightforward voice. "*Was ist passiert mit den Kriegunfälle. Nicht hauttief?"* ["What happened to your war-wounds? Not even skin-deep?"]

The question had a startling effect. The patient's manner changed instantly. From being in a sunny, cheerful mood he turned chalk-white and began to shake. For an instant he stared at me in what appeared bewilderment or even utter disbelief. Then he looked down and avoided my eyes. After what felt like ages he muttered, "*Zu spät, zu spät"* ["Too

² Hugh Thomas, *The Murder of Rudolf Hess,* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1979), p. 9

```
late, too late."]' 3
```

The medical care of Prisoner No. 7 remained the special concern of British military doctors in Berlin until the aged prisoner was found dead in a summer house in the prison garden on the afternoon of 17 August 1987. Both Hugh Thomas and the son of Rudolf Hess, Wolf Rüdiger Hess, soon concluded that the prisoner in Spandau had been murdered. They were alerted by suspicious results from a post-mortem examination by Professor Wolfgang Spann at the Forensic Medical Institute in Munich. For Hugh Thomas and Wolf Rüdiger Hess, with their suspicions of murder, the death came conveniently just as President Gorbachev's Perestroika government was about to lift a Soviet ban on Prisoner No.7's humanitarian release



Four days after the reported suicide of the last war crimes prisoner of Spandau, Professor Wolfgang Spann carried out a second autopsy on the body of Prisoner No. 7 at the Forensic Medicine Institute of Munich University. Professor Spann reported that 'an almost horizontal course of the strangulation mark could be identified, this finding, as well as the fact that the mark on the throat obviously was not located above the larynx, is more indicative of a case of throttling than of hanging. Under no circumstances can the findings be readily explained by a so-called typical hanging.'

³ The Murder of Rudolf Hess (see note 2) p. 24

Following the publication of Thomas's second book (*Hess: a Tale of Two Murders* ⁴) in 1988, the British government, under dogged pressure from the MPs Dale Campbell-Savours and Rhodri Morgan, struggled to handle worldwide doubt about the true identity of the prisoner. Doubts had been voiced as early as 1945 by the US spymaster Allen Dulles, who suspected that one of the three British spy services had bamboozled the world at Nuremberg by handing over a *doppelgänger* for trial as a war criminal. A US Army doctor, Captain Ben Hurewitz, conducted a minute examination of the prisoner at Nuremberg, noting two very small scars incurred during captivity in Britain but no scars whatsoever from a rifle shot through the lung in Romania in 1917.

By 1989 Thomas knew that the British authorities, the world pioneers in DNA profiling, had acquired everything needed for settling the *doppelgänger* question by using reliable DNA tissue samples in a British laboratory. He knew that the British army's honorary forensic pathologist, Professor J. M. Cameron of London University, had sent all the samples from his autopsy on the 'suicided' Spandau prisoner to London.

Rhodri Morgan MP, a former British civil servant and future first minister of Wales, joined Hugh Thomas in persuading Wolf Rüdiger Hess to give evidence to a Scotland Yard murder investigation conducted by Detective Superintendent Howard Jones and to give a DNA sample of his own blood to the Yard's forensic pathologist, Professor David Bowen.

Professor Bowen also compared the Munich autopsy with the 'suicide conclusion' reached by four doctors and four prison governors assembled by the Four Allied Powers in Berlin. Bowen agreed with Spann that bruising in the deeper neck tissues and bruising of the top of the head were features not of hanging but of strangulation by throttling and Bowen stated: 'Doubts must remain on the reliability of the official statement given concerning the death of Rudolf Hess.' ⁵

The forensic pathologist Dr Iain West, who had conducted notable *postmortems* on Robert Maxwell, Jill Dando and PC Yvonne Fletcher, later warned Hugh Thomas that the British government were unlikely to release the results of any DNA comparison between the tissue from Berlin and the blood sample given by Wolf Rüdiger to Professor Bowen.

In January 1989, the British deputy foreign minister Lynda Chalker MP assured the Conservative MP Cyril Townsend:

'Those who attach any credulity to Mr Thomas's claims might ask

⁴ Hugh Thomas, *Hess: A Tale of Two Murders* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1988)

⁵ Obituary of Bowen, *Daily Telegraph* 12 April 2011

https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/obituaries/8446356/Professor-David-Bowen.html>.

themselves why an impostor should unnecessarily condemn himself to more than forty years in Spandau Prison. The matter has rightly not caught the public attention in any serious way. Our handling of it has been designed to discourage further fruitless argument.⁶

Mrs Chalker spoke too soon. On 28 February 1989, *BBC Newsnight* screened a 30-minute TV report in which both Professor Spann and the prison nurse Abdallah Melaouhi told the reporter Olenka Frenkiel that they suspected the prisoner had been murdered. Thomas also noted that Spann did not see scars on the prisoner's chest consistent with the rifle bullet through the lung that had nearly killed the young soldier Hess in a battle in Romania in 1917. Three days later, Chancellor Helmut Kohl complained to 80 journalists that 'The British have still not released the documents on Rudolf Hess.'

For the British government, sitting on Hess files that were by law closed until 2017, the problem simply would not go away. CBS 60 Minutes confronted the former American Spandau governor Colonel Eugene Bird with the Thomas theory in 1990 and revealed that early in 1987 President Gorbachev had decided to lift the 41-year Russian veto on releasing the last war crimes prisoner in Spandau.

Karel Hille of the Dutch Tros channel produced a TV investigation titled *De moord* op de *dubbelganger van Spandau*, prompting the retired head of MI6, Sir Maurice Oldfield, to arrange for Hille to be given a Foreign Office personal file on Rudolf Hess for safekeeping abroad. Sir Maurice, a historian by training, had worked with Hugh Thomas in Ireland and admitted not only his personal fascination with the case but also that MI6 wartime involvement in the case had never been revealed to their post-war successors.

A shelved BBC Scotland TV investigation, later absorbed into a *BBC Timewatch* production, uncovered a 1917 Bavarian military doctor's certificate for Lt. Rudolf Hess that described the entry and exit scars:

'Three fingers above the left armpit, a pea-sized, blueish-coloured, nonreactive scar from an entry wound. On the back, at the height of the fourth dorsal vertebra, two fingers from the spine, a non-reactive exit gunshot wound the size of a cherry stone. No ill effects.'

Hugh Thomas and a number of leading pathologists found it difficult to convince British politicians that 'bullet wounds never go away':

'Two post mortems found no trace of any gunshot wounds, even using multiple soft tissue X-rays, extensive microscopic examination of the lungs, and specialist techniques to look for minute metallic residue.

⁶ Letter from Lynda Chalker, Minister of State, to Cyril Townsend MP, 11 January 1989.

Neither did extensive body photography, using a Bronica camera, show any break in the minute "Langer's Lines" of the skin when held directly over the entrance and exit sites.' ⁷

When Dr Christopher Andrew, author of the authorised history of MI5, presented the *Timewatch* report ⁸ dismissing the *doppelgänger* theory, the retired MI6 officer Charles Fraser-Smith, the original for Ian Fleming's 'Q', came forward to insist that the prisoner, for whom Fraser-Smith had made a 'double' uniform, was widely known in wartime MI6 circles as the 'phoney Hess'.

Despite Conan Doyle's maxim that 'When you have eliminated all which is impossible, then whatever remains, however improbable, must be the truth',⁹ Hugh Thomas's *doppelgänger* claim remained hard to accept but hard to demolish until *Forensic Science International: Genetics,* produced by Elsevier in Amsterdam for the International Society for Forensic Genetics, released the paper by thirteen authors, '*Rudolf Hess – The Doppelgänger Conspiracy Theory Disproved'*.¹⁰

New Scientist in London announced on January 22, both in print and by Twitter:

Exclusive: DNA solves Rudolf Hess doppelgänger conspiracy theory

Now the mystery has finally been solved by a piece of DNA detective work by a retired military doctor from the US Army and forensic scientists from Austria. They conclude that the prisoner known as Spandau #7 was indeed the Nazi criminal Rudolf Hess.

Hess has continued to generate historical interest. He was one of Hitler's close friends and a leading <u>Nazi</u> politician, and then there's the extraordinary manner of his attempted peace deal with the UK. After his death, his grave in the town of Wunsiedel became a Neo-Nazi rallying site, which in 2011 led the German authorities to exhume and cremate Hess's body, scatter the ashes at sea, and destroy the grave.

But not all of Hess's DNA had been destroyed. During his incarceration in Spandau, Hess was monitored and cared for as was any other prisoner.

⁹ From the Sherlock Holmes story 'The Adventure of the Blanched Soldier', by Arthur Conan Doyle in his *The Case-Book of Sherlock Holmes* (London: John Murray, 1927)

¹⁰ <https://www.fsigenetics.com/article/S1872-4973(17)30297-1/abstract>

⁷ Hugh Thomas, note to author, 7 February 2019.

⁸ The BBC Timewatch programme is currently available on YouTube at

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Q2xohnAUA1I> and Hugh Thomas's response, 'Hess, "Hess", Timewatch et al: Extract from Hugh Thomas' response to Timewatch', was published in *Lobster* 20 in 1990.

Spandau was run by officials from the UK, France, the United States and the Soviet Union, who rotated duties each month. In 1982, a blood sample was taken from Hess by a US army doctor, Phillip Pittman, as part of a routine health check. A pathologist, Rick Wahl, mounted some of the blood on a microscope slide to perform a cell count. The slide was labelled "Spandau #7" and hermetically sealed, and kept by Wahl for teaching purposes at the Walter Reed Army Medical Center in Washington DC.

In the mid-1990s, another US military doctor, Sherman McCall, was resident at the army hospital when he heard about the blood sample. "I first became aware of the existence of the Hess blood smear from a chance remark during my pathology residency at Walter Reed," McCall told *New Scientist*. "I only became aware of the historical controversy a few years later." McCall, who is trained in molecular pathology, immediately realised the slide's potential for solving the Hess controversy. "Making it happen," he says, "was another matter entirely."

McCall contacted Jan Cemper-Kiesslich, a molecular biologist in the DNA Unit at the department of legal medicine, University of Salzburg, Austria, and told him about the slide and the dried blood.

Working under standard forensic DNA protocols, Cemper-Kiesslich's team extracted DNA from the dried blood. Now they had to find a living male relative of Rudolf Hess to make a comparison. They got in touch with David Irving, a discredited British historian who has denied the Holocaust took place. Irving provided the phone number of Hess's son, Wolf Rüdiger Hess. "In the event, this number was disconnected," says McCall.

The involvement of the Nazi apologist David Irving and the participation of unnamed members of the Bavarian Hess family in this scientific project went unremarked by European reporters. But when the *Daily Telegraph* headlined on 23 January '*Conspiracy theory that Rudolf Hess was switched for doppelganger in Spandau prison, debunked by DNA'*,¹² an immediate challenge to the thirteen American and Austrian debunkers arrived by email. It came not from the Spandau army surgeon, but from a 1950 Spandau army dentist. Hans Eirew, a retired Manchester orthodontist who had been born in pre-war Vienna, sent this [unpublished] letter to the *Telegraph*:

¹¹ <https://tinyurl.com/y5b8qfo8> or <https://www.newscientist.com/article/2191462exclusive-dna-solves-rudolf-hess-doppelganger-ffconspiracy-theory/>

¹² <https://tinyurl.com/y769jjs9> or <https://www.telegraph.co.uk/science/2019/01/22/ conspiracy-theory-rudolf-hess-switched-doppelganger-spandau/>

During 1950/51 I was the British Army dental officer at Berlin military hospital. One of my responsibilities was the dental care of the war criminals at Spandau jail.

I had to extract a left upper molar for the very weird prisoner introduced as Rudolf Hess, at his insistence standing up and without pain killing injection.

Later I had access to the full official Nazi party medical records for the real Rudolf Hess, going back to his gunshot wounds in WW1. They showed that he had lost his upper left molar teeth early and had an artificial metal bridge where I was deemed to have extracted a tooth. My suspicions were supported by the fact that the other prisoners appeared to have very little contact with No.7 Hess.

I am in full support of Dr Hugh Thomas, who was then the most tested army gunshot expert with wide experience in Northern Ireland and who provided medical evidence that the man at Spandau was a "ringer".

Dr H L Eirew' 13

Thomas replies

The thirteen authors of 'The Doppelgänger Conspiracy Theory Disproved' have declared that their research was conducted under 'US military jurisdiction' and with ethical approval from Salzburg University:

'The blood sample from prisoner Spandau #7 was taken by one of the authors during regular medical care measures (including the preparation of the slide sample and Coulter Counter® analysis) under US military jurisdiction. Two living male members of the Hess family gave permission to use the slide sample for this study. The Ethics Committee of the Paris Lodron-University of Salzburg approves this study due to the contemporary historical relevance of the outcome, notwithstanding any legal, ethical or privacy concerns either for the Hess family or prisoner Spandau #7.'¹⁴

'Sir,

¹³ Since 1979 the Hess *Doppelgänger* question has ranked somewhere between the assassination of JFK and the Zinoviev Letter in the catalogue of unsolved conspiracies. Consequently it took less than three days in the online world of revisionist history for Joseph P. Farrell of Sioux Falls, South Dakota, a researcher 'in physics, alternative history and science' with 'a doctorate in patristics from the University of Oxford', to deliver his folksy reaction to the Austrian DNA claim at

<https://gizadeathstar.com/2019/01/the-hess-dna-thing/>. See also the comments of 'Jon' and 'Goshawk' beneath Farrell's piece.

On 1 February this year, Hugh Thomas MD FRCS, now retired as hepatobiliary pancreatic consultant surgeon at the Prince Charles Hospital in Merthyr Tydfil, said the new report lacks information on how, when and why the blood sample was drawn from the Prisoner in the tightly controlled prison at Spandau.

'What the New Scientist has described as a "piece of DNA detective work by a retired military doctor from the US Army and forensic scientists from Austria" would not satisfy most 21st century coroners. As a former medico-legal adviser to Northern Ireland solicitors I can say that most coroners would today ask for an independent, monitored repeat of the DNA test using material that is readily available. We have not been told the date on which this thirty year old blood sample was drawn from the prisoner. We are not told the identity of the member of the Hess family who supplied a matching sample of DNA. Furthermore, the decision of the Austrian researchers not to reveal either the genotype or haplotype of this DNA and to admit that their sample was for a time in the custody of the Hess family and delivered to the Austrian researchers by an unnamed member of that politically suspect family undermines the provenance of both samples. 'The Doppelgänger Conspiracy Theory Disproved' team have limited the information they give on how, where and why the blood sample to one sentence in a 22-page report:

'In the course of normal clinical care, one of the authors drew a blood sample from prisoner Spandau #7 upon which a Coulter® blood count was performed on December 15th, 1982.'¹⁵

Hugh Thomas, formerly senior medical consultant in the British sector of Berlin, continued:

'Reading between the lines of this report it appears that the Coulter blood count was taken after the blood had been taken 650km from Berlin to an American pathology laboratory at Heidelberg, at least seven hours away from Berlin by air in 1982. Coulter counters were large machines restricted to the laboratory in those days. Coulter counters were readily available at that time in Berlin, both at the British Military Hospital in Dickensweg, or at the American hospital near Wannsee. If a blood count was performed at Heidelberg on December 15th, 1982, then the blood sample cannot have been drawn from the prisoner that day.

Recent literature shows that the changes of deformation and degradation that occur in anticoagulated blood taken for the Coulter Counter mean that the accompanying slide should have been

¹⁵ See note 11.

completed within two or three hours. Considerable degradation would have occurred within a day, and 80% degradation would have occurred within four days, making it impossible to complete a differential Coulter count. This slide shows exactly such changes. ¹⁶

What is then surprising is that after storage for 30 years in the USA, an Austrian technician was surprised to find that "*the DNA from the slide sample appeared remarkably well-preserved*.¹⁷

The technician thought the blood was remarkably fresh, making for a far easier DNA extraction. He had a good reason for his opinion. I note that he used the Qiagen based HDplex handbook. This work is often slanted towards archaeological investigations, a personal interest of mine. Using his chosen scale, this means that the DNA degeneration of the blood slide he was working was just on, or over 20%:

(approx. 0.11 ng/ μ l for the small Y fragment, 0.017 ng/ μ l for the long fragment, <u>i</u>ndicating a degradation index 6.5)

In technical terms the slide was relatively very fresh and been completed pretty quickly, within about two hours or so of the blood having been taken. Since the report does not tell us when or exactly where the sample was originally drawn, one is bound to be as equally surprised at the result as the Austrian technician.

I am also surprised at the lack of any information about how and why the sample was drawn from the prisoner. In the years between the research for my first book and the death of the prisoner, my Spandau contacts and the prison warders kept me copiously informed of the medical schedules. I can certify that by that stage No. 7 had to be physically supported at all times by his warder, who also had to observe and record visits and procedures. There is no mention of this in what *The New Scientist* has described as "routine health check". I notice that the phrase *routine health check* has not been used by the authors of the scientific report.

Routine health checks in Spandau involved the four nations and were anything but routine, as they had to be agreed between their representatives beforehand and attended by a doctor from each of the four powers with the ever-present risk of an international incident.

Consultants have pointed out to me that there was no three-point lab identification to enable the identification of the slide in the pathology laboratory and protect the patient identity. The undated, pre-printed

¹⁶ Hugh Thomas to author.

¹⁷ <https://www.fsigenetics.com/article/S1872-4973(17)30297-1/fulltext>

label prepared by the pathologist Rick Wahl "who interpreted the blood smear and maintained it under unbroken custody for teaching purposes" adds to doubts about its authenticity. The only practical importance of the air-dried slide from 1982 was that it happened to permit a DNA identity check, after the invention of DNA identity tests in 1984 and long after their first use in the UK in 1986 and in the USA in 1987.

An ex-MI6 officer friend of mine was staggered to hear that despite the historian David Irving having been sent to prison in Austria in 2006 for denying the existence of gas chambers in Auschwitz and despite David Irving being permanently expelled from Austria, Jan Cemper-Kiesslich, at Salzburg in Austria, and the retired US Army doctor Sherman McCall in the USA should have used the same David Irving as their adviser in the search for remaining members of the Hess family. They must have known that Irving had personally led a campaign to clear Rudolf Hess's name, to establish Hess's decency and uphold him as a martyr for peace.

They say that Irving gave them a useless telephone number for Wolf Rüdiger Hess and that they were unaware that Wolf Rüdiger had died. Yet I have seen David Irving's genuinely moving letter to the family, sent from New Orleans as soon as he heard of the death. Wolf Rüdiger and David Irving shared right-wing nationalistic political views. I have only spoken to David Irving on a couple of occasions, but I know that he spent a huge amount of time with Wolf Rüdiger, cataloguing the very extensive Hess file. Irving's knowledge of the Hess family is unique.

As father figure to Wolf Rüdiger, Irving must have known why the telephone line had ceased. The authors of the report are seemingly unaware that Wolf Rüdiger and I were close friends and working towards the same goal. We had gone together to Scotland Yard, against the advice of Wolf Rüdiger's Irish solicitor, and Wolf Rüdiger had supplied DNA material for comparison with the huge amount of pathological material sent back by the pathologist Doctor Cameron. I have made innumerable requests through Parliament for the release of that DNA test. I was supported by the Scotland Yard pathologist Professor David Bowen. When Professor Iain West indicated that release of the DNA test result was unlikely, I contacted Wolf Rüdiger to stress that he should give and store a blood sample at his doctor's.

I understand that although the British government long ago ordered that the Cameron specimens be destroyed, some specimens migrated from one London hospital to another, so there remains an opportunity for two separate groups of scientists to carry out testing with absolutely clean provenance and without playing with slides. It is not therefore true to claim that "when the German government cremated Hess's remains in 2011, it was thought the last chance to pursue DNA analysis of the body had been lost". There were, and still are, samples of blood from the Hess family available in London and Munich and there is still tissue and blood from Prisoner No. 7 available in London and Munich. Somewhere in Britain there is also the suppressed DNA comparison report conducted under the control of the British government.'¹⁸

Prisoner No. 7 walks alone in the garden of Spandau Prison, Berlin, photographed covertly from a watch-tower by a British machine-gunner from the Grenadier Guards.



¹⁸ John Harris, author with Richard Wilbourn of *Rudolf Hess: Treachery and Deception* (Northampton: Jema Publications, 2016), reports that Wolf-Andreas Hess, grandson of Rudolf Hess, told him in 2015 that a DNA sample had been taken by the Hess family from the body in the grave at Wunsiedel in Bavaria before the body was cremated in July 2011.

•